

Singing as a Therapeutic Agent, in *The Etude*, 1891–1949

Bryan C. Hunter, PhD, MT-BC

Nazareth College, Rochester, New York

*The Etude music magazine, founded by Theodore Presser, was one of a number of popular music magazines published in the years prior to the establishment of the music therapy profession in 1950. During its publication run from 1883 to 1957, over 100 music therapy related articles appeared, including 13 on the health benefits of singing published between 1891 and 1949. Written by authors with diverse backgrounds, such as the famous Battle Creek, Michigan physician John Harvey Kellogg and Boston music critic Louis C. Elson, the articles contained consistent and adamant support regarding the health benefits of singing. The advantages described were both physical and psychological, and were recommended prophylactically for well persons and therapeutically for ill persons. Although the articles varied in perspective, from philosophical to theoretical to pedagogical, there is a consistent holistic medicine theme that appeared almost ahead of its time and no doubt linked to the push for vocal music education in that era. The importance of *The Etude* in promulgating ideas that helped shape the early practice of music therapy should not be underestimated. For much of its publication run *The Etude* was the largest music periodical in print, reaching its peak circulation of 250,000 copies per month in 1924.*

“I thoroughly believe in music both as a prophylactic and a therapeutic measure.” John Harvey Kellogg, MD, 1931.

The activity of singing in current music therapy practice is widely used with many types of clients to achieve a variety of therapeutic and educational goals. The historical basis for the use of singing, along with most aspects of music therapy practice, has not been extensively documented. Music periodicals published in the years prior to the establishment of the National Association for Music Therapy in 1950 (now the American Music Therapy Association)

are an important source of information on early music therapy related ideas and events. *The Etude* music magazine, published from 1883 to 1957,¹ contains over one hundred music therapy related articles. Thirteen of those articles address the health benefits of singing for both well and ill persons.

The last half of the nineteenth century saw a proliferation of music journals made possible by new technology and an improved post-civil war economy in which Americans had more free time to pursue the arts. Musical activity, in particular, was highly sought.² The popularity of the piano grew tremendously, fed by the middle class pursuit of "culture," and made possible by the founding of American piano companies such as Jonas Chickering in 1823 and Steinway and Sons in 1853. Piano, voice, and violin lessons were often given by German immigrant musicians who found that a respectable living could be made in this new post-war era.³ The musical development of America in this time period has been dubbed by some historians as the "genteel tradition," characterized by beliefs in optimistic idealism, promotion of Western culture, adherence to established standards of taste and craftsmanship, and the importance of beauty in human life.⁴

In the midst of this genteel era, Theodore Presser founded *The Etude* music magazine in October 1883, in Lynchburg, Virginia, for the expressed purpose of helping piano teachers instruct their students in the technic of piano playing. The next year he moved the publication to Philadelphia.⁵ Presser, born July 3, 1848, in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania,⁶ was a devoted music teacher. He held teaching positions at the Northwestern Ohio Normal School (now Ohio Northern University) at Ada, Ohio; Smith College and the Miami Conservatory of Music both in Xenia, Ohio; Ohio Wesleyan University, Delaware, Ohio; and Hollins Institute, near Roanoke, Virginia. In 1876, during his tenure at Ohio Wesleyan University, he

¹ Sr. Mary V. Davison, "American Music Periodicals. 1853-1899" vol. 2, (PhD diss., University of Minnesota, 1973), 466.

² Davison, "American Music Periodicals," vol. 1, 47.

³ *Ibid.*, 197.

⁴ Travis S. Rivers, "*The Etude* Magazine: A Mirror of the Genteel Tradition in American Music" (PhD diss., University of Iowa, 1974), 19.

⁵ Chris Yoder, "Theodore Presser, Educator, Publisher, Philanthropist: Selected Contributions to the Music Teaching Profession in America" (EdD diss., University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1978), 107.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 49.

cofounded the Music Teachers' National Association (MTNA), which grew into a strong organization still serving music teachers today.⁷

Presser's original intent was to return to teaching when and if *The Etude* became self-supporting. The magazine, however, evidently met a tremendous need among music teachers and the subscription list grew quickly. The venture was so successful that in 1889 Presser opened a retail music store in Philadelphia which subsequently became the Theodore Presser Company, a company extant today. By 1907, when Presser resigned as editor, the circulation of the magazine was 135,000 copies per month, making it the largest musical periodical in the world. In 1924 the periodical reached its peak circulation of over 250,000 copies per month. Before his death, on October 28, 1925,⁸ Presser accomplished a great deal of philanthropic work, largely through the establishment of the Presser Foundation. The Presser Foundation, still in operation today, maintained the Presser Home for Retired Music Teachers, awarded scholarships for college music majors, gave money to needy music teachers, and provided funds for music buildings on several college campuses.⁹

Throughout *The Etude's* seventy-four year history the magazine maintained its devotion to the technic of piano playing, but by 1885 the scope of the content began to broaden and included the following types of articles:

1. Editorial comment
2. Reports of the activities of the MTNA
3. Articles of philosophical, pedagogical, and psychological nature by the leaders in the field
4. Reviews of books and music
5. Concert programs and artist series
6. Irregular reporting of state music associations and music associations of foreign countries
7. Advertising of music publishers, music schools, etc.
8. Music-instructive pieces and musical pieces.¹⁰

The thirteen articles on the benefits of singing came from category number three in the above list, and occurred periodically between

⁷ Ibid., 55–61.

⁸ Ibid., 65–71.

⁹ Ibid., 179.

¹⁰ Ibid., 107.

1891 and 1949. Nine of the articles indicated the names of the authors, some of whom were of certain import.

The first article, "A New Instrument for Women, Giving Health Combined With Pleasure," appeared in June 1891. The author was May Lyle Smith, and as the title indicated, it was specifically for women. According to Smith, the social status of women at the time did not allow them to participate in the same activities as men that provided healthy exercise. The study of both the voice and the flute were recommended for the "improvement of the general health in those who need greater pulmonary activity." In addition:

The beneficial results of its use are soon seen on the lungs. Contracted chests (the outgrowth of stooping over school desks, or the consequences of the absurdities of dress) become expanded. More oxygen is taken into the system during the time of practice and playing, and the habit of deep inspiration thus acquired when the instrument is being used continues insensibly in the interim.

Let our girls make an attempt at this means of diversion which promises not only a vast deal of enjoyment, but what is far more to be desired and sought, a greater degree of good health.¹¹

Smith's writing reflected a continuity of thought, both in attitude towards women and the value of singing, that was present thirty years before in an article, "Music as a Means of Preserving Health," which appeared in *Dwight's Journal of Music* in 1861.¹² The article reported that Dr. Rush, a Philadelphia physician, supported the study of singing for young ladies as a form of healthy exercise since society prevented them from participating in other forms of exercise. In addition, singing was thought to help prevent consumption and improve the condition of those who had it.¹³

The publication of Smith's article, dealing exclusively with the benefits of singing for women, would seem at first glance to be

¹¹ May Lyle Smith, "A New Instrument for Women, Giving Health Combined With Pleasure," *The Etude* 9 (June 1891): 108.

¹² "Music as a Means of Preserving Health," *Dwight's Journal of Music* 19 (14 September 1861): 191; quoted in Alice-Ann Darrow, Alicia Clair Gibbons, and George N. Heller, "Music Therapy In *Dwight's Journal of Music*, 1853-1880: A Reflection of The Times," *MEH Bulletin* 2 (Fall 1986): 36-37.

¹³ *Ibid.*

ahead of its time with regard to the status of women. Presser, however, was undoubtedly aware that many of the piano teachers of that era were women.¹⁴

In 1897 *The Etude* published the article "Music In Its Relation to Health" by noted Boston music critic Louis C. Elson. Elson (1848–1920), a frequent contributor to *The Etude*,¹⁵ had a modest reputation as a singer,¹⁶ but was widely known as a music lecturer, writer, critic, and teacher. He wrote for the *Vox Humana*, *Boston Courier*, and *Boston Advertiser*, and taught at the New England Conservatory of music from 1880 until his death. Elson was highly regarded by his students, and his public lectures on music, given free of charge in civic halls and schoolhouses, were well attended.¹⁷

Elson considered the practice of proper singing to be an excellent source of "light gymnastics," and listed the following benefits:

1. Nasal breathing, considered to be an adjunct to health, is developed.
2. The diaphragm and other often dormant muscles are utilized.
3. The throat is strengthened.
4. The entire body experiences the vibration of each tone.
5. Unused air cells in the lungs are developed.
6. Calories are expended during deep breathing.¹⁸

The proclaimed benefits, although not backed by scientific data, are quite specific in nature. Furthermore, considering Elson's prolific writing, teaching, and lecturing, it seems highly probable that he propagated these ideas outside just this one article.

"Singing vs. The Doctor," appeared in the March 1897 issue, and was a reprint from *The Echo*, a short-lived arts magazine published from 1873–1874 in Providence, Rhode Island.¹⁹ The author was not identified, but the writer started by boldly stating: "The time will

¹⁴ Davison, "American Music Periodicals," 193.

¹⁵ Yoder, "Theodore Presser," 128.

¹⁶ *The New Grove Dictionary of American Music*, vol. 2, (London: MacMillan Press Limited, 1986), 43–44.

¹⁷ Allen Johnson, and Dumas Malone, eds., *Dictionary of American Biography*, vol. 6 (New York: Scribner's Sons, 1931): 119–120.

¹⁸ Louis C. Elson, "Music In Its Relation To Health," *The Etude* 15 (January 1897): 12.

¹⁹ Davison, "American Music Periodicals," 59.

soon come when singing will be regarded as one of the great helps to physicians in lung diseases in the incipient state." A reference is made to some statistics in Italy which demonstrated that vocalists lived long and healthy lives, and that brass instrumentalists never had consumption (pulmonary tuberculosis). Unfortunately, neither the statistics, nor their reference are given. The article recommended easy vocal exercises for those with consumption, and regarded moderate vocal practice as "the best system of general gymnastics that can be imagined, many muscles being brought into play that would scarcely be suspected of action in connection with so simple a matter as tone production."²⁰

An interesting editorial note from *The Etude* staff followed the reprint:

In line with the above clipping, we would like to add that the Hygienic Supply Company, of Boston, are manufacturing a little respiratory tube, which is invaluable not only to people with weak lungs, but to vocalists. Its construction is simplicity itself. One could be easily made from an ordinary cotton spool, but the principle of gentle resistance, covered by its construction, is recognized and applied very neatly.²¹

Further research is needed to determine the exact nature and function of this medical/musical tool, but the appearance of the note, along with the articles themselves, certainly indicated a strong interest by Presser or his staff in music in medicine.

The next two articles on singing appeared in April and December of 1898. The second article, "Hygienic Value of Singing," was essentially a reprint of the first one, "Hygienic Utility of Singing." The author, not identified in either version, summarized a report by Dr. Barth in the German journal *Archiv für Laryngologie und Rhinologie*.²² Dr. Barth, presumably a German physician, made the following observations about singing:

1. Singers take in more oxygen than other persons, specifically, singers take in 4000 to 5000 cubic centimeters of air in a single breath while the average man takes in 3200.

²⁰ "Singing vs. The Doctor," *The Etude* 15 (March 1897): 79.

²¹ Ibid.

²² "Hygienic Utility of Singing," *The Etude* 16 (April 1898): 121.

2. All the muscles of the neck and chest are exercised in singing.
3. Deep breathing enlarges the chest capacity and results in correct posture.
4. The ribs of singers are more elastic than nonsingers.
5. Singers in old age do not suffer the breathing problems associated with nonsingers.
6. Nasal breathing is promoted over injurious mouth breathing.²³

Barth's report is valuable in three ways. First, the report provided evidence that similar ideas regarding the health benefits of singing were present in Germany and the United States at about the same time. Secondly, Barth provided a specificity of data, particularly in the air intake measurements, that was heretofore unseen. Finally, the article indicates that further research in the German medical and music periodicals might prove profitable.

"Music and Health," appeared in the editorial section of the February 1911 issue of *The Etude*. Once again, the writer was not identified but the same zealous proclamations concerning singing were evident,

. . . we are firmly convinced that singing of the right kind is the very best kind of medicine one can take for various different ailments. We say this because we have seen the therapeutic action of singing upon depression, dyspepsia, headache and different other complaints.²⁴

Although the writer did not specify the benefits of singing on the ailments, the article is important in that it is the first one in *The Etude* to describe a beneficial effect of singing on depression—an area of mental illness in which music therapists have traditionally worked since the field's inception.

E. Ernest Hunt was the author of "Singing and the General Health," which appeared in the September 1916 issue. The article was a reprint from *The Music Student*, a London music publication,²⁵ and it appeared in *The Etude* in the Department for Singers. Hunt identified himself as a voice trainer and the nature of the ar-

²³ "Hygienic Value of Singing," *The Etude* 16 (December 1898): 372.

²⁴ "Music and Health," *The Etude* 29 (February 1911): 79.

²⁵ E. Ernest Hunt, "Singing and the General Health," *The Etude* 34 (September 1916): 666.

ticle was somewhat pedagogical. The main tenet expressed in the article was that the voice "is a barometer of the general health, and therefore one must at all costs attend to this." According to Hunt, singing benefited general health by increasing the aeration of the blood, and strengthening the throat; but incorrect vocal training would negate the benefits, particularly to the throat. In addition, correct singing demanded a high level of physical fitness, including proper rest and diet.²⁶

Although Hunt's article did not contain any ideas that are particularly different from previous writers, the article is unique in two ways. First, it is the only article on singing and health to appear in the Department for Singers, originally established as the Vocal Department in 1897.²⁷ The column, as would be expected, usually contained articles related to the technic of singing. The pedagogical nature of Hunt's article indicated clearly that the health benefits of good singing were the results of good teaching. While other writers had alluded to the idea, often using phrases such as "proper technique," or "good singing," nobody had made the connection as strongly as Hunt. Secondly, in a manner similar to that of Dr. Barth's German article, Hunt's writing indicated that comparable ideas on singing and health existed in England and the United States at the same time.

The topic of Eva E. Vollrath's article, "Health in Singing," April 1930, was the longevity of several noted singers. She offered the following proof that singing does prolong life in professional singers,

1. Minnie Hauk, American operatic singer, lived to age seventy-seven.
2. Madam Celeste Huntly Piccoili died in her ninetieth year.
3. Mathilde Marchesi, vocal teacher, lived to be eighty-six years old.
4. Manuel Garcia, vocal teacher, lived to be one hundred and one years old.
5. Lilli Lehmann, German singer, died at age eighty.
6. Ernestine Schumann-Heink, American contralto, was still singing at age seventy.²⁸

²⁶ Ibid.

²⁷ Rivers, " *The Etude Magazine*," 94.

²⁸ Eva E. Vollrath, "Health in Singing," *The Etude* 48 (April 1930): 283.

The ages quoted by Vollrath are impressive even by today's life expectancy standards, and it is not surprising that she and other writers noted such phenomenon. In order, however, for her theory to be substantiated, extensive historical and statistical research would be needed.

In July 1931 *The Etude* published the following letter from an eminent American surgeon Dr. John Harvey Kellogg:

To THE ETUDE:

I thoroughly believe in music both as a prophylactic and a therapeutic measure. My attention was first called to the value of music in the treatment of the sick, particularly the mentally infirm, by my old friend and teacher, the late Dr. George M. Beard, fifty years ago. Dr. Beard made experiments in music therapeutics in hospitals for the insane and noted a marked difference in the effects of music of different types.

In my work at the Battle Creek Sanitarium for more than fifty years, I have constantly made use of music as a means of creating an optimistic atmosphere. I found orchestral music so useful that I employ it systematically as a diversion and an entertainment; and I have incidentally found it useful as a means of occupying patients' minds and preventing them from talking about their ailments while eating their meals.

I have been particularly impressed with the value of singing. It is not only a diversion and wholesome mental occupation, and on this account health promoting, but it is also excellent lung gymnastics and promotes not alone breathing but the circulation as well. It especially aids circulation through the liver, stomach and other digestive organs, and so promotes digestion. Patients enjoy all sorts of popular songs, but I think they enjoy most of all the old-fashioned hymns and such stirring old songs as *Onward Christian Soldiers*.

Music must certainly take high rank as a psychic remedy, because of its power to inspire cheerful and hence healthful trains of thought. It thereby counteracts worry, apprehension, fear and other depressing emotions which create disease by producing poisonous secretions and so interfere with the recuperative and remedial processes whereby the body combats disease and restores the sick man to health.

I most heartily approve of your effort to encourage the use of music as a therapeutic measure and wish you Godspeed in your campaign to spread your music gospel.

Sincerely yours,

John Harvey Kellogg.²⁹

Dr. Kellogg's letter provided strong evidence that he supported the use of music in medicine, particularly singing. He agreed with earlier writers on the benefits of singing for the lungs, and in addition felt singing promoted digestion.

Kellogg's support for music in medicine was no doubt influenced by his family background and medical training. Kellogg (1852–1943) grew up in Battle Creek, Michigan, and was raised in the Seventh-day Adventist Church. At age twelve he began working in the Adventist publishing house and was influenced by the teachings of church leader Ellen G. White, who was promoting health reform principles for Seventh-day Adventists. Kellogg adopted the principles for his own lifestyle, including the practice of vegetarianism. He also read the works of health reformers Sylvester Graham and Dio Lewis. Kellogg's exposure to these ideas helped formulate his philosophy of medicine which he called "biologic living," or "the Battle Creek Idea."³⁰

In 1876 he became the medical superintendent of the Adventist's Western Health Reform Institute in Battle Creek. He changed the name to the Battle Creek Sanitarium, "himself choosing the last word, which he defined as 'a place where people learn to stay well.'³¹ As superintendent he implemented his philosophy based

on the principle that the curative forces are within the body rather than outside of it, and the treatment was directed to the removal of handicaps to the proper functioning of physical organs.³²

²⁹ John Harvey Kellogg, "A Great Physician Speaks for Music," *The Etude* 49 (July 1931): 484.

³⁰ Edward T. Jones, ed., *Dictionary of American Biography*, Supplement 3, 1941–1945, (New York: Scribner's Sons, 1973), 409.

³¹ *Ibid.*, 410.

³² *The National Cyclopedia of American Biography*, vol. 35, (New York: James T. White, 1949), 123.

After an extensive study of diet, he advocated abstinence from alcohol, tea, coffee, chocolate, tobacco, and condiments. Dairy products were to be used sparingly, in favor of more natural foods such as nuts, fruits, legumes and whole grains. Other treatment at the Sanitarium involved several types of physiotherapy including hydrotherapy, phototherapy, dietotherapy, mechanotherapy, electrotherapy, and "all other agents having therapeutic value."³³ Kellogg was not fond of drug therapies, and he worked continually on new treatment processes, one of which was the use of heat from electric light.³⁴ He ran an experimental food laboratory at the Sanitarium to develop nutritious foods, and in the early 1890s developed the process for flaking wheat, corn, and rice. This discovery led, of course, to the establishment of a breakfast food empire.³⁵ Finally, he invented several surgical procedures and tools, and wrote extensively about his medical practice.³⁶

The Sanitarium was a tremendous success, and many prominent Americans, including J. C. Penney, came to the facility regularly for its program of diet, exercise, and hydrotherapy.³⁷ In his later years Theodore Presser suffered from acute gastro-intestinal disorders and a weak heart. He, consequently, made several visits to the Battle Creek Sanitarium and became friends with Dr. Kellogg.³⁸ The relationship between the two men was undoubtedly important in Kellogg's letter being published, even though it appeared six years after Presser's death. At this point, we can only speculate as to the discussions these two very influential men may have had concerning music as therapy.

Kellogg's holistic medical philosophy, coupled with his exposure to the music therapy experiments of his teacher Dr. Beard, account for his attitude towards music expressed in his letter. Dr. Kellogg was an avid researcher who tried to establish a scientific basis for his teaching.³⁹ A study of his writings, as well as those of Dr. Beard's, would undoubtedly reveal important information on the use of music in medicine in this era.

³³ Ibid.

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ Jones, *Dictionary of American Biography*, 411.

³⁶ White *National Cyclopaedia*, 123-124.

³⁷ Jones, *Dictionary of American Biography*, 410.

³⁸ Rivers, *The Etude Magazine*, 56.

³⁹ Jones, *Dictionaries of American Biography*, 410.

An article entitled "Singing Cures Stammering," by William G. Armstrong appeared in August 1941. Armstrong stated boldly that if children were given singing lessons as early as possible in life, most cases of stammering would never develop. He offered both a theoretical and pedagogical approach to the use of singing in the treatment of stammering. Armstrong discussed the theory of stammering being caused by nervous excitement which results in a lack of coordination between the brain and the speech mechanisms, and is further complicated by a fear of future stuttering.⁴⁰ He felt that rhythm in music brought order to the nervous system, and that if a person could perform every action rhythmically the nervous system would always be in order. The desired tempo of the rhythmic beat should be the "perfect rhythm of the beating heart, or of respiration, and not that of 'jazz'".⁴¹ Armstrong recommended to the stutterer (as well as all singers) a series of physical, breathing, and vocal exercises to be done in rhythm at least twice a day.⁴²

Although he never stated it outright, Armstrong had evidently observed that stutterers often do not stammer when they sing. Current research indicates that while the previous observation is often true, there does not seem to be a consequent reduction of stuttering in regular speech.⁴³ Rhythm, however, is often used in speech development and serves as the basis for a current treatment technique called Melodic Intonation Therapy.⁴⁴ Armstrong's article is particularly noteworthy in that it is the first one in this series of articles to offer a theoretical basis for the treatment prescribed.

Four years later Armstrong wrote "Singing for Health," which appeared in July 1945. By this time it appears that the health benefits of singing proclaimed by earlier writers had become widely known and rather accepted. Armstrong began the article by noting the apparent good health and "preservation of mental and physical youthfulness," enjoyed by singers, and continued with:

⁴⁰ William G. Armstrong, "Singing Cures Stammering," *The Etude* 59 (August 1941): 521.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*, 522.

⁴² *Ibid.*, 522, 560.

⁴³ Herbert F. Galloway, Jr., "Stuttering and the Myth of Therapeutic Singing," *Journal of Music Therapy* 11 (Winter 1974): 202-207.

⁴⁴ Wanda B. Lathom and Charles Ts Eagle, Jr., eds., *Music Therapy For Handicapped Children*, vol. 2, 2d ed., (Lawrence, Kansas: AMS Publishing, 1984), 130.

Then we have the *commonly given advice* [italics mine] of physicians; take singing lessons, they will strengthen your lungs, improve your respiration, build you up, take you out of yourself, and so forth.⁴⁵

In addition, an interesting quote from Dr. Sylvester Graham, biologist, stated,

“The salutary influence of animated music, connected with exercise is very great; in fact, it may be almost said to be medicinal, for it actually has the most healthful effect on all the vital functions of the body. Vocal music ought to be as universal a branch of education as reading and writing, and instrumental music should be almost as extensively cultivated.”⁴⁶

This may indeed be the same Sylvester Graham whose writings influenced Dr. John Harvey Kellogg.

The purpose of Armstrong’s article was to further explain why the accepted benefits of singing were true. Armstrong’s interest in the relationship of music and neurophysiology, somewhat evident in his first article, becomes predominant in this article. He described the nervous system as having two parts: the cerebrospinal system, consisting of the brain and spinal cord; and the sympathetic system, consisting of the “solar plexus” and thirty-two spinal ganglia with connecting branches. The sympathetic system was said to control all vital activities of the body, including heart rate, blood circulation, blood chemistry, glandular systems, and digestion. He then quoted William Hanna Thompson,

. . . the sympathetic nervous system has its subjectiveness; it being extremely subjective to the influence of the emotions and sentiments as every physician knows.⁴⁷

Armstrong postulated that since singing was the exercise, usually pleasurable, of emotions and sentiments, the professional singer was constantly stimulating the sympathetic system in a healthful manner that facilitated its many vital functions including its connection to the brain. Thus, the influence of singing on the sympa-

⁴⁵ William G. Armstrong, “Singing for Health,” *The Etude* 63 (July 1945): 375.

⁴⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁷ Ibid.

thetic nervous system was thought to have major organic and emotional effects on the health of singers.⁴⁸

Armstrong explained the influence of singing on the lungs by noting that singers used three types of breathing: clavicular, costal, and diaphragmatic or abdominal. He felt that singers combined these types of breathing, and that this resulted in full inflation and efficiency of the lungs in a manner not achieved by nonsingers. The breathing phenomenon of singers was so important, he offered it as a rationale for including voice instruction in general education.⁴⁹ Armstrong concluded the article with some pedagogical breathing exercises similar to those in the previous article.

Although Armstrong's neurophysiological ideas may seem simplistic by today's standards, the article is evidence that interest in the relationship of music and neurology existed in the years just prior to the establishment of music therapy as a profession in 1950. Indeed, much of the research on the influence of music on the body occurred in the early years of the profession, and the subject is still one of intense interest among music therapists, music educators, and music psychologists.

The next issue of *The Etude*, August 1945, contained an article by Army physician Lieutenant Colonel George W. Ainlay, "The Place of Music in Military Hospitals." George Ainlay, MD, was also a violinist, pianist, and composer. A veteran of both World War I and II, he investigated the effects of music on psychiatric patients, and on physical functions such as the vasomotor and motor-secretory systems. While assigned to the Surgeon General's Office he was an adviser to the Committee on the Use of Music in Hospitals. He supervised the publication of *TB MED 87*, which outlined the Army's Medical Department policies on the use of music and sound in military hospitals. Lastly, he supported the establishment of "Departments of Music in Medicine," in universities.⁵⁰

Dr. Ainlay's article was not focused on singing per se, but rather on the development and implementation of music programs in military hospitals. He described a three staged treatment protocol

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Dorothy M. Schullian and Max Schoen, eds., *Music and Medicine* (New York: Henry Schuman, Inc., 1948; reprint, Freeport, New York: Books for Libraries Press, 1971), 473 (page references are to reprint edition).

that was successful with neuropsychiatric patients. The first stage involved the patients listening, in small groups, to folk songs usually being played on the piano. In this stage the words were not sung, but some history about the songs was explained, simply, to the patients. The second stage, to be started as soon as possible, was to have patients sing familiar songs. Patient participation at this point in therapy was considered to be of great value. The third stage involved the patients learning various music skills for recreational purposes, and he recommended use of the Army Air Forces book *Sit Down and Play*. Ainlay credited a First Lieutenant, Guy V. R. Marriner, with the development of the protocol.⁵¹

Ainlay's article is unique in that it documented a specified treatment procedure using music with psychiatric patients. Singing was considered an important and pivotal point in the therapy process. The three step procedure was considered successful, although little evidence was presented to support the claim. The use of music in the treatment of World War II veterans is often cited as a major impetus in the formation of music therapy as a discipline. Ainlay's writing is valuable because it provides insight into this era. He expanded his ideas somewhat in a chapter (same title as the article) in *Music and Medicine*, edited by Dorothy M. Schullian and Max Schoen, in 1948. At the end of the chapter he listed twelve War Department publications which, no doubt, contain a plethora of information on the use of music in military hospitals.⁵²

The final article on singing and health to appear in *The Etude* was in February 1949. According to an editor's note; the author, George Chadwick Stock, was a well known New England voice teacher, eighty-four years of age at the time of the publication.⁵³ Stock essentially restated the ideas of previous writers. He felt that well developed speech and song resulted in strong lungs, throat, and vocal organs, good posture, deep breathing, and physical and mental poise. He considered the "T," "K," "B," "G," "V," and "J" consonant sounds particularly important, because when they were pronounced distinctly they forced air pressure back into the lungs

⁵¹ George W. Ainlay, "The Place of Music in Military Hospitals," *The Etude* 63 (August 1945): 468, 480.

⁵² Schullian and Schoen, *Music and Medicine*, 322-351.

⁵³ George Chadwick Stock, "Sing Your Way Back to Health!" *The Etude* 67 (February 1949): 68.

resulting in healthful distention.⁵⁴ Stock's article is important, not for its new ideas, but for its reiteration of old ones at a rather recent date.

Several conclusions about the thirteen articles in *The Etude* can be made

1. The ideas about health and singing were consistent with other writers in this same period. A comparison to Dr. Rush's article in *Dwight's Journal of Music* has already been made. Solomon, in a study of music in special education before 1930, found that "singing has been used to involve the nonspeaking child in speech, to improve breathing, and to develop proper articulation."⁵⁵ Davis reported on Ohio physician Dr. Charles H. Merz's article "Music in Medicine," which appeared in the *Cincinnati Lancet-Clinic* in 1892. Merz felt that correct speaking and singing,

resulted in efficient respiration, development of the throat and lungs, toning of the abdominal muscles, increased circulation of the blood, improved digestion, and in fact, there was "no other exercise that will call forth the natural and uniform action of the whole system."⁵⁶

Merz offered the above results as a rationale for public school vocal music, a sentiment that William Armstrong later echoed. Davis also reported that,

Merz's position mirrored a trend in public education during the later years of the nineteenth century that emphasized "vocal culture" in American public schools. An examination of music journals of that era provided support from music educators to use vocal music in improving health and promoting correct breathing techniques among school children.⁵⁷

⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Alan L. Solomon, "Music In Special Education Before 1930: Hearing and Speech Development," *Journal of Research in Music Education* 28 (Winter 1980): 241.

⁵⁶ Charles H. Merz, "Music in Medicine," *Cincinnati Lancet-Clinic* 23 (1892): 847; quoted in William B. Davis, "An Analysis of Selected Nineteenth Century Music Therapy Literature" (PhD diss., University of Kansas, 1985), 148.

⁵⁷ Alex T. Cringen, "Music in Public Schools," *Music* 2 (1892): 29; quoted in Davis, "Music Therapy Literature," 147.

The articles in *The Etude* certainly reflected this same push for “vocal culture” which probably helped carry them into the twentieth century. In 1946 Sidney Licht, MD, wrote *Music In Medicine* in which he recognized the use of singing in speech development and as exercise for the muscles of the chest and abdomen. In addition, he recommended gentle humming and singing as a form of exercise for patients with fractured jaws or temporo-mandibular joint pathology.⁵⁸

2. Some shift in writing style occurred in the articles between 1891 and 1949. The early articles were philosophical in nature, while the later ones became more theoretical and pedagogical.

3. The therapeutic aspects of singing were espoused by influential people such as Elson, Kellogg, and Ainlay in a variety of disciplines, including music, medicine, and biology. Presser's inclusion of music therapy related articles in *The Etude* was critical in the dispersion of such ideas since the magazine maintained a large subscription. The motivation to include such articles probably came from at least three sources; the push for vocal music education mentioned earlier, a desire to broaden the magazine's readership, and a genuine humane interest in the value of music in people's lives.

4. The proclaimed benefits of singing by American writers were also echoed to some extent in England and Germany.

5. The articles point to some additional potentially valuable areas for historical research in music therapy. The work of Kellogg, Beard, and Ainlay appears particularly promising.

6. The thirteen articles in *The Etude* on the relationship of health and singing illustrated a longevity of ideas on music in medicine that occurred in American music periodicals as early as 1861.⁵⁹ The publication of Stock's article in 1949, just sixteen months before the founding of the National Association for Music Therapy (June 2, 1950),⁶⁰ brought a rather consistent body of ideas and attitudes on the therapeutic aspects of singing to the doorstep of the music therapy profession.

⁵⁸ Sidney Licht, *Music In Medicine* (Boston: New England Conservatory of Music, 1946), 57-58.

⁵⁹ Darrow, Gibbons, and Heller, “Music Therapy In *Dwight's Journal of Music*,” 36.

⁶⁰ Ruth Boxberger, “A Historical Study of The National Association For Music Therapy” (PhD diss., University of Kansas, 1963), 2.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ainlay, George W. "The Place of Music in Military Hospitals." *The Etude* 63 (August 1945): 433, 468, 480.
- Armstrong, William G. "Singing Cures Stammering." *The Etude* 59 (August 1941): 521, 522, 560.
- Armstrong, William G. "Singing for Health." *The Etude* 63 (July 1945): 375, 406.
- Boxberger, Ruth. "A Historical Study of The National Association For Music Therapy." PhD diss., University of Kansas, 1963.
- Cringen, Alex T. "Music in Public Schools." *Music* 2 (1892): 28–33.
- Darrow, Alice-Ann, Alicia Clair Gibbons, and George N. Heller. "Music Therapy In *Dwight's Journal of Music*, 1853–1880: A Reflection of The Times." *MEH Bulletin* 2 (Fall 1986): 20–38.
- Davis, William B. "An Analysis of Selected Nineteenth Century Music Therapy Literature." PhD diss., University of Kansas, 1985.
- Davison, Sr. Mary V. "American Music Periodicals, 1853–1899." Vols. 1 and 2. PhD diss., University of Minnesota, 1973.
- Elson, Louis C. "Music In Its Relation To Health." *The Etude* 15 (January 1987): 12.
- Galloway, Jr., Herbert F. "Stuttering and the Myth of Therapeutic Singing." *Journal of Music Therapy* 11 (Winter 1974): 202–207.
- Hunt, Ernest E. "Singing and the General Health." *The Etude* 34 (September 1916): 666.
- "Hygienic Utility of Singing." *The Etude* 16 (April 1898): 121.
- "Hygienic Value of Singing." *The Etude* 16 (December 1898): 372.
- Johnson, Allen, and Dumas Malone, eds. *Dictionary of American Biography*, Vol. 6. New York: Scribner's Sons, 1931.
- Jones, Edward T., ed. *Dictionary of American Biography*, Supplement 3, 1941–1945. New York: Scribner's Sons, 1973.
- Kellogg, John Harvey. "A Great Physician Speaks for Music." *The Etude* 49 (July 1931): 484.
- Lathom, Wanda B., and Charles T. Eagle, Jr., eds. *Music Therapy For Handicapped Children*, Vol. 2, 2d ed. Lawrence, Kansas: AMS Publishing, 1984.
- Licht, Sidney. *Music In Medicine*. Boston: New England Conservatory of Music, 1946.
- Merz, Charles H. "Music in Medicine." *Cincinnati Lancet-Clinic* 23 (1892): 845–848.
- "Music and Health." *The Etude* 29 (February 1911): 79.
- "Music as a Means of Preserving Health." *Dwight's Journal of Music* 19 (14 September 1861): 191.
- Rivers, Travis S. "*The Etude* Magazine: A Mirror of the Genteel Tradition in American Music," PhD diss., University of Iowa, 1974.
- Schullian, Dorothy M., and Max Schoen, eds. *Music and Medicine*. New York: Henry Schuman, Inc., 1948; reprint, Freeport, New York: Books for Libraries Press, 1971.
- "Singing vs. The Doctor." *The Etude* 15 (March 1897): 79.
- Smith, May Lyle. "A New Instrument for Women, Giving Health Combined With Pleasure." *The Etude* 9 (June 1891): 108.
- Solomon, Alan L. "Music in Special Education Before 1930: Hearing and Speech Development." *Journal of Research in Music Education* 28 (Winter 1980): 236–242.
- Stock, George Chadwick. "Sing Your Way Back to Health!" *The Etude* 67 (February 1949): 68.

The National Cyclopedia of American Biography, Vol. 35. New York: James T. White, 1949.

The New Grove Dictionary of American Music, Vol. 2. London: MacMillan Press Limited, 1986.

Vollrath, Eva E. "Health in Singing." *The Etude* 48 (April 1930): 283.

Yoder, Chris. "Theodore Presser, Educator, Publisher, Philanthropist: Selected Contributions to the Music Teaching Profession in America." EdD diss., University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, 1978.